



UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR
NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION CERTIFICATION APPLICATION
PART 1 – EVALUATION OF SIGNIFICANCE

RECEIVED

OMB Approved
No. 1024-0009
FEB 25 2015
Rev. 2014

2015-011
NPS Project Number
31983
SC Department of
Archives & History

Instructions: This page must bear the applicant's original signature and must be dated. The National Park Service certification decision is based on the descriptions in this application form. In the event of any discrepancy between the application form and other, supplementary material submitted with it (such as architectural plans, drawings and specifications), the application form takes precedence. A copy of this form will be provided to the Internal Revenue Service.

1. Property Name Jonathan Badger's West Tenement

2015-011

Street 43 Tradd Street

City Charleston County Charleston

State SC Zip 29401-2539

Name of Historic District Charleston Historic District

National Register district certified state or local district potential district

2. Nature of request (check only one box)

- certification that the building contributes to the significance of the above-named historic district or National Register property for rehabilitation purposes.
- certification that the building contributes to the significance of the above-named historic district for a charitable contribution for conservation purposes.
- certification that the building does not contribute to the significance of the above-named district.
- preliminary determination for individual listing in the National Register.
- preliminary determination that a building located within a potential historic district contributes to the significance of the district.
- preliminary determination that a building outside the period or area of significance contributes to the significance of the district.

3. Project Contact (if different from applicant)

Name Sarah Fick Company _____

Street Post Office Box 525 City Charleston

Zip 29402-0525 Telephone (843) 723-4675 Email Address sfick@att.net

RECEIVED
MAR 25 2015
NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
TAX INCENTIVE PROGRAM

4. Applicant

I hereby attest that the information I have provided is, to the best of my knowledge, correct. I further attest that [check one or both boxes, as applicable] (1) I am the owner of the above-described property within the meaning of "owner" set forth in 36 CFR § 67.2 (2011), and/or (2) If I am not the fee simple owner of the above-described property, the fee simple owner is aware of the action I am taking relative to this application and has no objection, as noted in a written statement from the owner, a copy of which (I) either is attached to this application form and incorporated herein, or has been previously submitted, and (II) meets the requirements of 36 CFR § 67.3(a)(1) (2011). For purposes of this attestation, the singular shall include the plural wherever appropriate. I understand that knowing and willful falsification of factual representations in this application may subject me to fines and imprisonment under 18 U.S.C. § 1001, which, under certain circumstances, provides for imprisonment of up to 8 years.

Benjamin P. Jenkins III Benjamin P. Jenkins III 12/17/15
Name Marianne W. Jenkins Signature Marianne W. Jenkins

Applicant Entity _____ SSN _____ or TIN _____
Street 316 Colville Road City Charlotte State NC
Zip 28207-1912 Telephone (704) 779-6064 Email Address ben_jenkins@bellsouth.net

NPS Official Use Only

The National Park Service has reviewed the Historic Preservation Certification Application – Part 1 for the above-named property and has determined that the property:

- contributes to the significance of the above-named district or National Register property and is a "certified historic structure" for rehabilitation purposes.
- contributes to the significance of the above-named district and is a "certified historic structure" for a charitable contribution for conservation purposes.
- does not contribute to the significance of the above-named district.

Preliminary Determinations:

- appears to meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation and will likely be listed in the National Register of Historic Places if nominated by the State Historic Preservation Officer according to the procedures set forth in 36 CFR Part 60.
- does not appear to meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation and will likely not be listed in the National Register.
- appears to contribute to the significance of a potential historic district, which will likely be listed in the National Register of Historic Places if nominated by the State Historic Preservation Officer.
- appears to contribute to the significance of a registered historic district if the period or area of significance as documented in the National Register nomination or district documentation on file with the NPS is expanded by the State Historic Preservation Officer.
- does not appear to qualify as a certified historic structure.

4/23/15
Date

Antonio Siquilar

National Park Service Authorized Signature/

NPS comments attached

HISTORIC PRESERVATION CERTIFICATION APPLICATION
PART 1 – EVALUATION OF SIGNIFICANCE

Property name	Jonathan Badger's West Tenement	NPS Project Number	
Property address	43 Tradd Street	Charleston	Charleston
		SC	29401-2539

5. Description of physical appearance

43 Tradd Street is the west half of a ca. 1746 double tenement. The three-story building is laid out as a Charleston single house: one room wide, two rooms deep, with a center entry at the west side. A narrow paved walkway, also used as a parking spot, leads to the entry and on to the back garden; the east wall is a party-wall with 41 Tradd Street. The kitchen, narrower than the main house, extends from its rear wall. The two buildings are connected by a brick hyphen, date unknown. The patio garden is bounded by a brick wall with a modern brick shed room built against it. There are no outbuildings.

The brick double building has a hipped roof clad in standing-seam metal. Two brick double chimneys rise above the common wall. The unified south façade is laid in Flemish bond, each tenement with three openings at the ground floor and two window openings at both upper levels. Openings at the lower levels have brick jack arches. Windows are 9/9 wood sash except at the shorter attic-level openings, which have 6/6 sash. There is a row of earthquake bolt caps above the second floor level.

43 Tradd's first-floor west opening is an entry with a modern wood door (sealed and not used).

The west elevation of 43 Tradd Street is laid in English bond, but the jack arches are repeated at the side and rear elevations. The entry opening is framed with pilasters and has a hipped pent roof. The double door and transom are set in a deep paneled recess. The kitchen house is mirrored by the east tenement's kitchen house. Under a gabled roof with brick parapet, the two are divided by a party wall and served by a double chimney. The kitchen house has been altered several times, and has modern window sash and doors. The two-story hyphen between kitchen and main house is laid in Flemish bond and has a large arched opening.

The interior of 43 Tradd Street features a mix of historic and modern finishes. (An ambiguous note in the 1852 Tax Assessor's Book indicates the building had "burnt" and was vacant.) Flooring throughout is wide heart-pine. The kitchen house interiors are modern. Despite the changes, the interior retains its traditional single-house plan and historic openings, and contributes to the significance of the building as a form constructed for more than 200 years.

Date(s) of building(s) ca. 1746 Date(s) of alteration(s) 19th and 20th centuries

Has building been moved? no yes, specify date _____

6. Statement of significance

43 Tradd Street is a fine example of a colonial tenement house. The ca. 1746 brick building retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and contributes to the significance of the Charleston Historic District.

Historical Background

Jonathan Badger's West Tenement is half of a double tenement building erected about 1746. The lot on which the building stands was described as 44' X 96' when Badger bought it in 1746, and as 44 X 98' when he and his wife, Mary, sold it to Alexander Cormack, a tailor, in 1763. The two tenements were eventually divided as separate parcels. In 1852, 43 Tradd Street was described as a three-story brick building on a lot 21' wide; the east tenement, today's 41 Tradd Street, occupied a 40'-wide property.

By 1852, Badger's West Tenement had come into the ownership of William H. Inglesby (1785-1866), an attorney and Charleston's city treasurer; it later passed to his wife Cecilia Elizabeth Smith Inglesby (1803-1877). Living on Logan Street, they used it as a rental property. After Mrs. Inglesby's death, in 1878 her executors sold the tenement to the executors of John Slattery. It remained in Slattery's estate as a rental property well into the twentieth century.

In 1931, Edward Ely, acting through a trustee, paid \$3,150 for 43 Tradd Street, and the next year he had the property conveyed to his wife, Sarah C. Ely. The Elys made their residence at 43 Tradd Street. After her death in 1957, it was sold to Benjamin F. McGuckin, who then transferred ownership to his wife, Gertrude. Like the Elys, the McGuckins lived at 43 Tradd until their deaths, even after Mrs. McGuckin had deeded the property to their son B. F. McGuckin, Jr. He sold 43 Tradd Street in 1992. Originally intended as a rental property, the house has been used as the primary residence of its owners since the early twentieth century.

3

ISSUES

- Extensive loss or deterioration of historic fabric
- Moved property
- Substantial alterations over time
- State recommendation inconsistent with NR documentation
- Significance less than 50 years old
- Functionally related complex or multiple buildings within an individual nomination
- Obscured or covered elevation(s)
- Other (explain)

4

Complete items below as appropriate:

- (1) 1700-1941 is the period(s) of significance of the district.
- (2) The property is mentioned in the NR or state or local district documentation, Section _____, Page _____.
- (3) For preliminary determinations, the status of the nomination for the property/historic district:
 - Nomination has already been submitted to State Review Board, and will be forwarded to the NPS within _____ months. Draft nomination is enclosed.
 - Nomination was submitted to NPS on _____.
 - Nomination process will likely be completed within thirty months.
 - Other, explain: _____
- (4) The property is located in a registered district but its current condition is inconsistent with the determination of its contribution to the district as stated in the nomination. Supplemental Listing Record requested.

5

Describe problematic issues or other concerns:

The Jonathan Badger Tenements, consisting of separate parcels at 41 and 43 Tradd Street, were built ca. 1746 as rental units under single ownership. They remained as such for perhaps the first century of their existence. They were never functionally related during or since the Charleston Historic District's period of significance, 1700-1941, and had a common party wall, but no connections between them, and with separate chimneys built within the party wall. The back-to-back chimneys are noticeably different in appearance as they rise from the roof. Sometime prior to 1852 the duplex was divided into two separate ownership parcels, and that is reflected still in both the 1884 and 1888 Sanborn maps [enclosed with Part 1 by SHPO staff reviewer]. Interestingly, the roof of 43 Tradd [West Tenement] is clad in standing seam metal, while that of 41 Tradd [East Tenement] features a pantile roof. The duplex is thought to have been built by the local cabinetmaker, Jonathan Badger, sometime after he purchased the lot in 1746. Badger and his wife sold the property in 1763 to local tailor, Alexander Cormack. Either Badger made interior renovations and changes to interior detailing before he and his wife sold it or Cormack made them after he purchased it.

See attachments: photographs maps other: Sanborn maps [1884 and 1888]

NPS COMMENTS:

Date

NPS Reviewer

Historic Preservation Certification Application

State Historic Preservation Office Review & Recommendation Sheet

Significance – Part 1

Project number: _____

1

Property: Jonathan Badger's West Tenement, 43 Tradd
Historic District: Charleston Historic District

NR District

Certified State or Local District

Preliminary Done

A&H number: 2015-011

2/25/15 Date application received by State
_____, _____ Date(s) additional information
received by State

2/25/15 Date complete information received by State

3/20/15 Date of transmittal to NPS

Property visited by State staff? yes no

SHPO REVIEW SUMMARY

- Fully reviewed by SHPO
- No outstanding concerns
- Owner informed of SHPO recommendation
- In-depth NPS review requested
- Recommendation different from applicant's request

2

STATE RECOMMENDATION

AWC
3/20/15
Andrew W. Chandler, Architectural Historian, who meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards, has reviewed this application.

The property is included within the boundaries of a registered historic district, contributes to the significance of the district, and is a "certified historic structure" for the purpose of rehabilitation.

The property is included within the boundaries of a registered historic district, contributes to the significance of the district, and is a "certified historic structure" for a charitable contribution for conservation purposes in accordance with the Internal Revenue Code.

The property does not contribute to the significance of the above-named district.

Insufficient documentation has been provided to evaluate the structure.

This application is being forwarded without recommendation.

Preliminary determinations:

The property appears to meet National Register Criteria for Evaluation and will be nominated.

The property does not appear to meet National Register Criteria for Evaluation and will not be nominated.

The property appears to contribute to the significance of a:

potential historic district that appears to meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation and will likely be nominated.

registered historic district but is outside the period(s) or area(s) or significance as documented in the National Register nomination or district documentation on file with the NPS.

The property is located in a proposed historic district and:

The property does not appear to contribute to the significance of the proposed historic district.

The proposed historic district does not appear to meet the NR criteria for Evaluation and will not be nominated.

3/20/15

Date

Christina M. Johnson

State Official Signature

43 Tradd Street

43 Tradd Street is the west half of a double tenement built ca. 1746 by Jonathan Badger. Owned after 1763 by Alexander Cormack, then his widow, then his daughter Mary Cormack Brailsford (d. 1821). By 1852 it was in the ownership of Inglesby. Not found: conveyance of 43 Tradd from Mrs. Brailsford or her executor

1681 Town Lot 41 granted to Thomas Clouter: extending west from Church Street halfway to Meeting Street.

1686 Clouter sold east half of Lot 41 to William Scott: 39 Tradd and properties east to Church Street

1686 Clouter sold west half of Lot 41 to John Beresford, 41-49 Tradd Street.

1693 Beresford sold west half, 41-49 Tradd, to Thomas Elliott, carpenter

1694 Elliott sold half of his Tradd Street frontage: $\frac{1}{4}$ to Thomas Booth, $\frac{1}{4}$ to Joseph Ellicott, bricklayer.¹

1746 Jonathan Badger purchased lot 44X96 from Anne Elliott Saunders Waight, who had received it by the 1730 will of her father, Thomas Elliott.²

43 Tradd Street 28' X 97' Part of Town Lot 41; part of Badger's 44X96'
39-41 Tradd Street 39' X 99' Part of Town Lot 41; part of Badger's 44X96' + 20"+
of the parcel sold 1686 to William Scott

May 1&2 1763, lease & release, Jonathan Badger, gentleman, and his wife Mary to Alexander Cormack, tailor, all of Charleston. Parcel 44X98 bounding east on Col. Robert Brewton, south on Jordan Roche, west on Rev. Mr. Lorimore. Cormack gave Badger a mortgage.³

1759 Alexander Cormack married Mary Godwin, spinster.⁴

11/6/1772 Will of Alexander Cormack, tailor. Wife Mary Cormack, 1/3 of estate. Daughter Mary Cormack <21, rest and residue. If daughter die without issue, then after widow's death, to my brother James and my sister Margaret, both of Caithness in North Britain (Scotland).⁵

4/30/1774 acknowledgment to Mary Cormack, executrix Alexander Cormack.
1763 mortgage to Badger has been paid in full, 44' bounding north on Tradd Street.⁶ 41-43 Tradd

¹ Bates & Leland, Volume 3.

² 41 Tradd Street, 1988 notes on file, Historic Charleston Foundation.

³ Charleston RMC Deed Book O3, p. 546, cited in Langley's *Abstracts*.

⁴ Register of St. Philip's Parish.

⁵ Charleston County Will Book 15, p. 596, proved 10/8/1773.

⁶ Charleston RMC Deed Book G4, p. 236.

By 1787 Mary Cormack, widow of Alexander Cormack, married James Donaldson, carpenter.⁷

10/1788 Mary Cormack, daughter of Alexander Cormack and Mary Godwin Cormack Donaldson, married Morton Brailsford, merchant.⁸

1803 Morton Brailsford, accountant, 22 Tradd Street
1807 Mary Brailsford, widow, 22 Tradd Street

4/25/1809 died James Donaldson, carpenter, in his 65th year. Native of Wyck in Caithness, in this state upwards of 36 years ... useful, industrious citizen and a truly honest man.⁹

His will written 4/3/1809 mentions several lots on the north side of Tradd – Nos. 101, 102, 103, 104, 105. Heirs are his brother William Donaldson, carpenter, his brothers and sisters of Wick Parish, Caithness Shire, North Britain; and Mary Brailsford (house on Sullivans Island, furniture, slaves, Lots 103, 104, 105 with houses, rest&residue). Ex'trix Mary Brailsford, ex'ors James Nicholson and James Scott.¹⁰ North side Tradd

10/1/1821 will of Mary Brailsford, widow. Executor to sell real and personal estate to divide among children. Morton, James, William; Christiana, wife of Tacitus G. Shine; Harriet, wife of Joseph Paine.¹¹

9/28/1822 Inventory, Mrs. Mary Brailsford, by executor Samuel Prioleau. Household goods & etc., doesn't give a location of her residence.¹²

2/25/1823 Samuel Prioleau, executor Mrs. Mary Brailsford, to David A. King, \$2560. Lot with 3-story brick tenement and other buildings, Lot 41, south side Tradd Street. 21' in front X 96'6", 20' on back line. B&B west now or late Inglesby, east by lot lately purchased by Solomon Legare.¹³ 41 Tradd? 39 Tradd?

6/14/1847 To Samuel Chapman, \$3300. Lot with buildings, 40' on street, 96'6" on west line, from west to east on back line 20', then northward 35', then east 20', then north 69' on the east line to the street. B&B west on Lot 41, east partly now or late W. Kelly (35 Tradd). By W. Moultrie Brailsford, trustee under a marriage settlement of Dr. Edward Brailsford dated 3/25/1802.¹⁴ 39-41 Tradd

⁷ SC Historical Magazine, Vol. 8-9.

⁸ SC Historical Magazine, Vol. 5.

⁹ City Gazette 5/3/1809

¹⁰ Charleston County Will Book 31, p. 218, proved 5/5/1809.

¹¹ Charleston County Will Book 35, p. 679, proved 4/30/1822.

¹² Charleston County Inventory Book F, p. 457.

¹³ Charleston RMC Deed Book M9, p. 108.

¹⁴ Charleston RMC Deed Book F12, p. 308.

1852 Ward Book, Tradd Street west of Church
33 Tradd, 3-story brick, Capt S. Chapman, 40X90. 39-41 Tradd
35 Tradd, 3-story brick, W. H. Inglesby then Mrs. C. S. Inglesby, 21X96. Notation
"burnt" 43 Tradd
37 Tradd, 2-story wood, Dr. Inglesby, 40X70 45 Tradd
39 Tradd, 3½-story brick, Dr. Inglesby, 20X110. 47 Tradd

1861 City of Charleston Census, south side Tradd Street
35 Tradd, brick, Samuel Chapman owner-occupant 39-41 Tradd
37 Tradd, brick, William H. Inglesby, vacant 43 Tradd
39 Tradd, wood, Dr. Inglesby owner, Artemas J. Burke occ 45 Tradd
41 Tradd, brick, Dr. Inglesby owner, Joachim Palma occupant 47 Tradd
43 Tradd, brick, Mrs. Ann M. Brown, owner-occupant 47 Tradd

8/11/1859 Will of William H. Inglesby, attorney. To my son Charles, my law library and furniture appertaining to the law office. To my dear wife Cecilia, the rest of my estate. I am assured that she will make provision for our children.¹⁵

1/30/1869 To Cecilia E. S. Inglesby, widow, by Joseph S. Inglesby, George Evans, Martha Ellen Evans his wife, William G. Inglesby, Joseph L. Inglesby, Marty Catherine Inglesby, Anna Inglesby, and Matilda B. Inglesby, \$175. A strip of land, 5' on Tradd Street, part of Lot 39 (45 Tradd Street). Bounding south on Samuel C. Black, east on said Cecilia, west on land of said grantees under the will of the late Henry Inglesby. Provided that: the dwelling house in Lot 39 partly stands on the strip herein conveyed, is not to be disturbed until the owners should of their own free will, remove or pull it down, or should it be destroyed by fire or otherwise. In which case it is not to be rebuilt on any portion of this strip.¹⁶

Inglesby: Cecilia Elizabeth Smith (1803-1877), daughter of Dr. Henry Smith (grandson of the first Landgrave Thomas Smith of South Carolina). Her mother died at her birth, and her father remarried three years later. The family moved to Alabama, and after her father's death, Cecelia returned to Charleston and married William Henry Inglesby (1785-1866) on November 28, 1826. They are both buried in the Unitarian Churchyard. Hon. William H. Inglesby, for many years Treasurer of the City of Charleston. Dr. Charles Inglesby (1838-), son of William H. & Cecilia Inglesby.¹⁷

6/11/1878 43 Tradd Street, Sale at auction, executor Cecilia E. S. Inglesby to Philip Fogarty and Thomas Hogan, executors of John Slattery, \$1330. Mrs. Inglesby's will directed sale of any or all of her real and personal estate. Lot with three-story brick tenement and other buildings, 21'X96'6", 20' on back line.

¹⁵ Will Book 51, p. 731.

¹⁶ RMC Deed Book L15, p. 105.

¹⁷ Misc genealogy websites.

Bounding south on lot now or late Estate S. C. Black, east on the other tenement of the same house, formerly of Dr. William Brailsford, now or late of Chapman (41 Tradd), west on William Inglesby's lot (45 Tradd). Also a strip of land immediately west, part of Lot 39, five feet on Tradd, bounding south Est. Samuel C. Black, west on remaining portion of Lot 39.¹⁸

5/30/1931 43 Tradd Street, Gaillard plat, SC Historical Society, not seen.

7/15/1931 43 Tradd Street, Master in Equity to Hasell Rivers, trustee for Edward Ely, \$3150. Ref. 1931 complaint, Della C. Holliday, et al, vs. Anna M. Holliday, et al, re. real estate formerly of Fogarty and Hogan, executors of John Slattery.¹⁹

5/31/1932 Edward Ely, husband of Sarah Ely, requested Hasell Rivers, trustee, to convey the property to her. Lot formerly said to have been 26' on Tradd, by recent survey 27.8', in depth formerly 96'6" but now 96' on the east line, 96.8' on the west line, 26.8' on the back line. Gaillard plat May 30 1931. Bounding south on Huger, formerly Black, east on Jersey, formerly Chapman, west on McCloskey.²⁰

City directories show Edward and Sarah Ely residents of 43 Tradd Street

9/30/1957 Sarah C. Ely died April 25, 1957. Her executor, SCNB, to Benjamin F. McGuckin.²¹

10/1/1957 Benjamin F. McGuckin to his wife Gertrude McGuckin, \$10+love&affection.²²

12/22/1976 Gertrude T. McGuckin to Benjamin F. McGuckin Jr. of 1318 Pembroke Drive, Charleston 29407, \$10+love&affection.²³

City directories show Benjamin and Gertrude McGuckin residents of 43 Tradd; Gertrude listed there as late as 1984.

6/25/1992 McGuckin to Alvis M. Baucom

6/5/1996 Baucom to J. Addison Ingle and Helen G. Ingle

2004 to Augustus Oemler Jr. and Deborah G. Warren

2009 to Stanley M. Stevens and Kristin B. Stevens

¹⁸ RMC Deed Book L17, p. 168.

¹⁹ RMC Deed Book H34, p. 196.

²⁰ RMC Deed Book Z36, p. 463.

²¹ RMC Deed Book Q64, p. 268.

²² RMC Deed Book Q64, p. 281.

²³ RMC Deed Book E11, p. 25.