

CONTEMPORARY
LEGAL EDUCATION
SERIES

Water Law, Planning & Policy

CASES AND MATERIALS

JOSEPH L. SAX

Water Law, Planning & Policy

CASES AND MATERIALS

Joseph L. Sax

Associate Professor of Law
University of Michigan

THE BOBBS-MERRILL COMPANY, INC.
A SUBSIDIARY OF HOWARD W. SAMS & CO., INC.
PUBLISHERS • INDIANAPOLIS • KANSAS CITY • NEW YORK

Copyright © 1968 by THE BOBBS-MERRILL COMPANY, INC.
Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 68-29410
Printed in the United States of America
All Rights Reserved

Table of Contents

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Summary Table of Contents</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxv
<i>Glossary</i>	xxxix

INTRODUCTION. THE TWO BASIC LEGAL REGIMES IN WATER LAW: RIPARIANISM AND APPROPRIATION	1
CHAPTER 1. PUBLIC PLANNING FOR WATER USE: THE NORTHWEST- SOUTHWEST DIVERSION	5
Introduction	5
I. The Ascertainment of Goals	6
A. Background	6
B. Technical Proposals and Policy Issues	12
Clark, Northwest-Southwest Water Diver- sion—Plans and Issues, 3 Willamette L.J. 215, 216, 239-43, 246-48, 254-62 (1965)	12
Notes	26
C. Project Evaluation: Benefit-Cost Analysis	29
1. Introduction	29
2. The Official Adoption of Benefit-Cost Analysis: Senate Document No. 97	30
Policies, Standards and Procedures in the Formulation, Evaluation and Review of Plans for Use and Development of Water and Related Land Resources, Sen. Doc. No. 97, 87th Cong., 2d Sess. 7-12 (1962)	30
Note	35
3. Critiques of Benefit-Cost Analysis	35
Eckstein, Water Resource Development 25, 39-42, 47-48 (1958)	35
Fox & Herfindahl, Efficiency in the Use of Natural Resources: Attainment of Effi- ciency in Satisfying Demands for Water Resources, American Econ. Rev., May 1964, at 198, 201-05	38

	<i>Page</i>
Folz, Public and Private Investment in Resources Development, in Land and Water Use 333-34 (1963)	42
4. Proposals for Improving the Evaluation Process	43
Fox & Herfindahl, Efficiency in the Use of Natural Resources: Attainment of Efficiency in Satisfying Demands for Water Resources, American Econ. Rev., May 1964, at 198, 199-200, 206	44
Notes	45
McConnell, Private Power and American Democracy 212-14, 227-30 (1966)	47
Notes	49
Hearings on S. 3107, Before the Senate Comm. on Interior and Insular Affairs, 89th Cong., 2d Sess. 14-15, 18, 20, 165, 169-70, 183-84 (1966)	51
Notes	54
Scenic Hudson Preservation Conf. v. Federal Power Comm'n	55
Note	57
Morgan, Comment: Standing to Sue and Conservation Values, 38 U. Colo. L. Rev. 391, 393-94 (1966)	57
Notes	59
White, Broader Bases for Choice: The Next Key Move, in Perspectives on Conservation: Essays on America's Natural Resources 206-08, 210-11, 216-25 (1958).	59
Notes	69
II. Implementing the Planning Process	71
A. Protecting the Area of Origin in Regional Reallocations: Background	71
Clark, Northwest-Southwest Water Diversion—Plans and Issues, 3 Willamette L.J. 215, 248-54 (1965)	71
Notes	75
B. Legal Bases for Regional Reallocation	77
Arizona v. California	78
Trelease, Arizona v. California: Allocation of Water Resources to People, States, and Nation, 1963 S. Ct. Rev. 158, 176-83	80
Meyers, The Colorado River, 19 Stan. L. Rev. 1, 47-49, 50-53 (1966)	85

	<i>Page</i>
1. Apportionment of Interstate Streams	89
2. The Power to Provide for the General Welfare	90
3. Management and Disposal of Federal Property	92
4. The Navigation Servitude	94
5. Reserved Rights	95
6. Commerce Clause Power	95
7. Equitable Apportionment in the Court	96
III Water Resources Law, The Report of the President's Water Resources Policy Comm'n 58, 59-63 (1950)	96
Nebraska v. Wyoming	98
Notes	99
C. Augmentation of Water Supplies: Saline Water Conversion, Weather Modification and Conserva- tion	101
CHAPTER 2. MANAGING WATER USE	103
I. Federal Management Model: The Bureau of Reclama- tion	103
A. Introduction	103
Sax, The Federal Reclamation Law, in 2 Waters & Water Rights 121-22 (1967) ..	104
B. The Interplay Between State and Federal Law	105
<i>In re</i> Application 5625, Calif. State Water Rights Bd. (1961)	109
Notes	113
Sax, Problems of Federalism in Reclama- tion Law, 37 U. Colo. L. Rev. 49, 77-79, 81-82 (1964)	115
C. Rights to Reclamation Project Water	119
Contract Between United States and Coll- bran Conservancy Dist.	120
Petition to Collbran Conservancy Dist. for Allotment of Irrigation Water	123
Rules and Regulations of Collbran Con- servancy Dist., Sec. II	125
Notes	128
Sax, Selling Reclamation Water Rights: A Case Study in Federal Subsidy Policy, 64 Mich. L. Rev. 13-15, 32-35, 36-44 (1965) ..	130
Anderson, Windfall Gains from Transfer of Water Allotments Within the Colo- rado-Big Thompson Project, 40 Land Econ. 265, 268, 270-71 (1967)	138

	<i>Page</i>
Note	141
D. The Excess-Land Law: Water and the Problem of Monopoly	142
Sax, The Federal Reclamation Law, in 2 Waters & Water Rights 210-14 (1967) ..	142
Notes	143
Sax, The Federal Reclamation Law, in 2 Waters & Water Rights 217-24 (1967) ..	146
II. Urban Water Supply: The New Riparianism	151
A. The Interstate Compact as a Management Model: New York City	151
1. Introduction	151
2. Factual Background	153
3. The Legal Situation	159
New Jersey v. New York	162
Note	165
Delaware River Basin Compact, Pub. Law 87-328, arts. 2, 3, 10, 13, 14, 15	166
4. Utilization of the Legal Structure: The 1965-1966 Drought	172
Hogarty, The Delaware Water Emergency 9, 12 (1966)	174
Notes	176
5. Planning for the Future	178
Perrin, New York's Forgotten Drought, The Nation, June 5, 1967, at 721-23	182
B. Municipal Acquisition of Water Rights: Reservations for Future Use, Condemnation and the Extent of Riparian Rights	185
1. Reservations for Future Use: Conditional Decrees, Relation Back and Due Diligence	185
Metropolitan Suburban Water Users Ass'n v. Colorado River Water Conservation Dist.	187
Notes	194
2. Condemnation of Water Rights	199
Lee, Acquisition of Riparian Rights in New York, 1964 Proc. Am. Bar Ass'n Sec. of Mineral & Natural Resources Law 13, 14-21	203

	<i>Page</i>
Lauer, The Riparian Right as Property, in Water Resources and the Law 131, 206-11 (1958)	208
Notes	210
Southwest Engineering Co. v. Ernst	212
Notes	215
III. Administrative Agencies and the Courts: The Appropri- ation System	218
A. Introduction	218
B. Natural Stream	219
C. Appropriation: The Diversion Requirement	219
D. Beneficial Use	220
E. The Permit System	221
Johnson Rancho County Water Dist. v. State Water Rights Bd.	224
Notes	229
F. Adjudication and Administration of Water Rights	230
G. Problem: The Scope of Appropriative Rights, Their Maintenance, Loss and Transfer	234
1. The Facts	234
2. Changes in the Point of Diversion or Place of Use: Issues Raised	238
Trelease & Lee, Priority and Progress— Case Studies of the Transfer of Water Rights, 1 Land & Water L. Rev. 1, 24-29 (1966)	238
Ellis, Water Transfer Problems: Law, in Water Research 233, 234-38 (1966)	241
3. Protection of Junior Appropriators	243
Hartman & Seastone, Efficiency Criteria for Market Transfers of Water, 1 Water Re- sources Research 165-66, 168-70 (1965) ..	244
Ellis, Water Transfer Problems: Law, in Water Research 233, 244-48 (1966)	247
Note	251
Seastone & Hartman, Alternative Institu- tions for Water Transfers: The Experi- ence in Colorado and New Mexico, 39 Land Econ. 32, 35-38, 41-42 (1963)	251
Notes	255

	<i>Page</i>
4. Protection of Seepage Appropriators	256
Bower v. Big Horn Canal Ass'n	257
Notes	260
5. The Content of Appropriative Rights: Ex- tended Use	262
Salt River Valley Water Users' Ass'n v. Kovacovich	268
Notes	270
6. Beneficial Use and the Prohibition on Waste	271
7. Loss of Water Rights: Forfeiture, Abandon- ment, and Prescription	284
(a) Forfeiture and Abandonment in the Ap- propriation System	284
(b) Forfeiture and Abandonment in the Ri- parian System	287
(c) Prescription	287
CHAPTER 3. RECREATION, CONSERVATION AND AESTHETICS	291
I. Recreational Use of Lakes and Streams	291
Problems	298
Note	300
Water Resources and the Law 59-61 (1958)	300
Problems (Cont'd)	301
Thompson v. Enz	302
Problems (Cont'd)	304
Waite, The Dilemma of Water Recreation and a Suggested Solution, 1958 Wis. L. Rev. 542, 547-48	305
Notes	306
II. The Impact of Conservation Values upon Water Use ..	308
A. Introduction	308
B. The Storm King Case: Scenic Hudson Preservation Conference v. Federal Power Commission	311
<i>In re</i> Consolidated Edison Co., Brief of Scenic Hudson Preservation Conf.	313
<i>In re</i> Consolidated Edison Co., Brief of Applicant	341
<i>In re</i> Consolidated Edison Co., Reply Brief of Scenic Hudson Preservation Conf. ..	354
Notes	358

	<i>Page</i>
C. Legal Principles in the Cases	359
Texas East Transmission Corp. v. Wildlife Preserves, Inc.	359
Note	361
<i>In re</i> Namekagon Hydro Co.	361
D. Some Theoretical Observations About Maintenance of Conservation Values	364
Boulding, The Economics of the Coming Spaceship Earth, in Environmental Quality in a Growing Economy 9-12 (1966)	365
Krutilla, Conservation Reconsidered, 57 American Econ. Rev. 777, 778-86 (1967)	368
Leopold, A Sand County Almanac 222-41 (1966)	375
Ecological Research and Surveys, Hearing Before Sen. Comm. on Interior and Insular Affairs on S. 2282, 89th Cong., 2d Sess. 112-13 (1966)	384
CHAPTER 4. POLLUTION	387
I. A General Introduction to the Enforcement Process	387
Wisconsin Dep't of Resource Dev., Criteria Categories	391
Tarzwell, Water Quality Requirements for Aquatic Life, in Proceedings of the Nat'l Symposium on Quality Standards for Natural Waters 190-92 (1966)	393
Carmichael, Forty Years of Water Pollution Control in Wisconsin: A Case Study, 1967 Wis. L. Rev. 350, 380-81 ...	404
II. Effluent Taxes: The German Model	407
Hearings Before Special Subcommittee on Air and Water Pollution of the Sen. Comm. on Public Works, 89th Cong., 1st Sess., Pt. 3, 914-16, 919, 934, 936-38, 940-45, 951-53 (1965)	407
Notes	416
III. Economic Incentives	416
IV. Private Law Remedies for Pollution Control	422
Whalen v. Union Bag & Paper Co.	422

	<i>Page</i>
Pennsylvania Coal Co. v. Sanderson	424
Note	428
Hines, Nor Any Drop to Drink: Public Regulation of Water Quality, 52 Iowa L. Rev. 186, 196-201 (1966)	428
V. Appendix: Source Materials on Water Pollution	431
Federal Water Pollution Control Act, § 466g	431
Fed. Water Pollution Control Admin., Guidelines for Establishing Water Qual- ity Standards for Interstate Waters 2-11 (1966)	437
Mich. Stat. Ann. §§ 323.3-323.10	443
CHAPTER 5. GROUND WATER AND OTHER SPECIAL WATER SOURCES	449
I. Ground Water	449
A. An Introduction to the Physical Facts	449
Robinove, Ground-Water Studies and Analog Models, U.S. Geological Survey Cir. 468 (1962)	450
Explanatory Note	457
The Role of Ground Water in the Na- tional Water Situation, U.S. Geological Survey Water Supply Paper 1800 (1963)	458
B. A Description of Legal Regimes Governing Ground Water	459
1. Introduction	459
2. Absolute Ownership	460
3. Reasonable Use	462
4. Correlative Rights	462
5. Mixed Systems	463
6. Appropriation	465
Notes	467
C. Ground Water Mining: The Problem of Diminish- ing Supplies	468
D. Management of Ground Water Basins	471
Reis, Legal Planning for Ground Water Production, 38 S. Cal. L. Rev. 484, 486- 89 (1965)	472
Reis, A Review and Revitalization: Con- cepts of Ground Water Production and Management — The California Experi- ence, 7 Nat. Res. J. 53, 63-66 (1967)	474

TABLE OF CONTENTS

xxiii

	<i>Page</i>
Central & West Basin Replenishment Dist. v. Adams	477
Note	489
II. Seepage and Spring Water: Diffused Surface Water	489
III. Foreign Waters	490
IV. Developed Waters	492
V. Enemy Waters	493
Keys v. Romley	493
Note	500
VI. Flood Control	500
White, Optimal Flood Damage Manage- ment: Retrospect and Prospect, in Water Research (1966).....	500
Some Highlights of 1967 Flood Insurance, Resources, No. 27, at 7-8 (1968).....	506
Note	508
<i>Index</i>	509