

SYMPHONY No. 2, IN B FLAT, OPUS 57

Vincent d'Indy (1851-1931)

VINCENT D'INDY, the principal disciple and major biographer of César Franck, wrote both the first and the last of the four great symphonies contributed by the Franckian school. These four works are d'Indy's Symphony on a French Mountain Air, for orchestra and piano obbligato, composed in 1886; the symphony by Franck himself, which dates from 1888; the symphony by Ernest Chausson (1890); and the work with which we are at present concerned, completed in 1902. In 1918 d'Indy wrote a third symphony, with the highly significant title De Bello Gallico, but this has not found its way into the general repertoire.*

Each of the Franckians was a personality in his own right, and each of the Franckian symphonies is a highly individual creation; nevertheless all the music of that school is distinguished by its thorough-going devotion to a principle of musical structure commonly called cyclic form. This term was coined by d'Indy to describe in a general way any and all devices whereby the several movements of a symphony, sonata or string quartet may be bound together and related to each other. Occasional instances of cyclic procedure may be found in the works of practically every composer of symphonies, sonatas and quartets in the literature, from Mozart to Brahms, but for the school of Franck organic integration within the framework of a composition in large form was a basic article of faith. The Franckians wrote nothing in which this unity is not apparent, and they achieve it by much more complex and involved means than those employed by others. In this, according to many critics, they reflect the influence of Liszt and his "transformation of themes" and of Wagner and his leading motifs. And it is worth observing by the way that in more than one passage the second symphony of d'Indy reflects the general character and style of Wagner's Parsifal.

Cyclic form as employed by Franck and d'Indy really involves the use of two quite different devices. The first of these is the direct, unchanged or little changed and instantly recognizable quotation of material from earlier movements in later. The second is the derivation, by subtle and remote processes, of thematic ideas from germinal motifs. The germinal motifs are very markedly altered in the process of budding out into the new themes, and the

The supremacy of Pierre Monteux as an interpreter of French music is attested by the fact that he has now recorded three of the four symphonies mentioned above for Victor, with the San Francisco Symphony Orchestra. His recording of the Symphony on a French Mountain Air, in which Maxim Schapiro plays the piano solo, is Victor Masterworks Set No. 913, and his version of the Franck is Set No. 840.

San Francisco Symphony Orchestra Pierre Monteux, Conductor

relation of seed and flower is often difficult to perceive unless it is demonstrated.

There are two germinal motifs in the second symphony of d'Indy, as in the symphony by Franck. They are both presented in the first four measures of the work, and are labeled A and B in the quotations below. These two figures are the source of most of the thematic material heard later. The intervals of Motifs A and B may be altered to a greater or less degree, their rhythm may be completely transformed, and altogether new melodic processes may grow out of them; nevertheless they control some or all of the general shape of the themes to come. Motif A produces Examples 6 and 7 and the first part of 10. Motif B produces Examples 1, 3, 4, 9, the second part of 10, 11 and 12. Examples 5, 8 and 13 are difficult to relate to either germinal motif. Example 2 grows out of secondary ideas in Example 1. Example 14 is derived from both germinal motifs.

Ī

Extrêmement lent, B flat,* 4/2 time. The main movement is preceded by a slow introduction, 13 bars long, devoted to the two germinal motifs on which the entire work is based. The first is stated at once by the 'celli, basses and harps:

The second follows instantly (Motif B actually overlaps the last half of the last bar of A) in the woodwind, with its principal melodic interest in the flute:

*D'Indy calls this work Symphony in B Flat, not Symphony in B Flat Major, even though the signature of B flat major is employed. This is due to the fact that the modality at the outset is deliberately indeterminate, and the first two notes—B flat and D flat—actually imply B flat minor. Later composers also insist, and with better reason, upon avoiding suggestions of definite modality in their titles. Stravinsky's Symphony in C and Milhaud's Symphony in F are good examples.



Motif A is restated with the third trombone added to the original combination. B comes back again, and the two ideas are worked over with gradually accelerating pace to conclude the introduction.

The main movement now begins (Très vif, B flat major, 3/4 time) with the principal theme, derived from Motif B, in the solo horn:



This is repeated in varied form by the strings. Shortly a transition theme, derived from Motif X in Example 1, appears in the woodwind:

and is also worked over. During the course of its treatment Motif A is heard in its original form in the deep bass instruments. Eventually the long, lyrical second theme, also derived from Motif B, appears in the violins (Un peu plus modéré, 3/2):



and is worked over to conclude the exposition and the first record side.

The music goes back to the original tempo and time signature (3/4) at the beginning of the second side as the development section gets under way. All three of the principal themes—the horn solo of Example 1, the transition figure of Example 2, and the lyrical violin theme of Example 3—are treated in elaborately contrived combinations. About half way through the second side Motif A is added by the basses and 'celli, and keeps the center of the stage to the end of the disc, which is also the end of the development.

Side 3 is the recapitulation and conclusion of the movement. The principal theme (Example 1) comes back in B