

**Final Report**  
**Islamorada Historical and Archaeological Survey**  
**Islamorada, Village of Islands, Florida**

Prepared for:  
Islamorada, Village of Islands  
DHR Grant No. F0803

Prepared by:  
Matthew G. Hyland, Ph.D., Project Architectural Historian  
Megan L. Otten, Cultural Resources Specialist  
Paula R. Miller, Lead Archaeologist

GAI Consultants, Inc.  
301 East Pine Street, Suite 1020  
Orlando, Florida 32801  
GAI Project No. C080707.00

June 17, 2009

**Final Report**  
**Islamorada Historical and Archaeological Survey**  
**Islamorada, Village of Islands, Florida**

**Prepared for:**  
**Islamorada, Village of Islands**  
**Monroe County, Florida**

**DHR Grant No. F0803**

**GAI Consultants, Inc.**  
**301 East Pine Street, Suite 1020**  
**Orlando, FL 32801**

**GAI Project No. C080707.00**  
**June 17, 2009**

## Acknowledgements

This project, which is supported by a Florida Division of Historical Resources grant, could not have been completed without the assistance, support, and cooperation of many people in Islamorada. Special thanks are due to staff at the Islamorada Planning Department. The comments and support of Islamorada's residents are appreciated. As a founding member of the Islamorada Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) and its former chair, Irving Eyster's early advocacy for the preservation of Islamorada's historical and archaeological resources has enriched our understanding of our community's heritage.

Jim Clupper, archaeologist and former librarian at the Helen Wadley Branch of the Monroe County Library system in Islamorada, provided historical and professional assistance throughout the survey. He deserves special thanks for his quick response in providing important historical documents, access to archaeological sites, and files from the library's Florida Collection. The authors also extend a personal appreciation for Irving Eyster's dedication to Islamorada's rich cultural legacy.

Members of Islamorada's Historic Preservation Commission also made valuable contributions to the survey by offering recollections of important local events and people. Members of the commission are: Jim Clupper, Chair; Barbara Edgar, Vice Chair; Henry Rosenthal, Richard Russell, and Glenn T. Taylor, Sr.

The authors also wish to thank the Islamorada Planning & Development Services Department staff for facilitating the survey and guiding it to its successful completion. Edward Koonis, AICP, Director, and Kevin Bond, Planner/Historic Preservation Commission Liaison/Project Manager provided access to sites and thoughtful comments on the content of the report. The documentation associated with this report will be archived in perpetuity at the Florida Division of Historical Resources.

Abstract

Consultant:	GAI Consultants, Inc. 301 East Pine Street, Suite 1020 Orlando, Florida 32801	407.423.8398
Client:	Islamorada, Village of Islands Planning & Development Services Department 81990 Overseas Highway PO Box 568 Islamorada, Florida 33036	305.664.6400
Scope of Services:	Conduct a Reconnaissance-level Architectural and Archaeological Survey in Islamorada, Village of Islands, Monroe County.	
Principal Investigator:	Matthew G. Hyland, Ph.D., Project Architectural Historian	
Purpose:	To identify, update, and document the architectural and archaeological resources that are at least 50-years old in Islamorada, Village of Islands, Florida	
Date(s) Conducted:	6-14 October 2008 and 10-13 February 2009	
Project Name:	Islamorada Historical & Archaeological Survey	
City/County/State:	Islamorada, Village of Islands, Monroe County, Florida	
Survey Area:	Within the present Islamorada municipal boundary.	
# of Surveyed Resources:	29 archaeological resources and 390 architectural resources in the survey area.	
Recommended Actions:	Nominate the Red Cross/Hurricane Houses to the NRHP under the existing New Deal Resources in Florida multiple cover or draft a Hurricane Houses of Islamorada multiple cover; nominate potential Pen Key Club Historic District and potential Bay Ridge Historic District to the NRHP and Islamorada's register; nominate individually significant historic properties to the NRHP and Islamorada's local register of designated sites. See Section 6.2 for a full list of recommendations.	

This project has been financed in part with historic preservation grant assistance provided by the National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior, administered through the Bureau of Historic Preservation, Division of Historical Resources, Florida Department of State, assisted by the Florida Historical Commission. However, the contents and opinions do not necessarily reflect the views and opinions of the Department of the Interior or the Florida Department of State, nor does the mention of trade names or commercial products constitute endorsement or recommendation by the Department of the Interior or the Florida Department of State. This program receives Federal financial assistance for identification and protection of historic properties. Under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, and the Age Discrimination Act of 1975, as amended, the U.S. Department of the Interior prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, national origin, disability, or age in its federally assisted programs. If you believe you have been discriminated against in any program, activity, or facility as described above, or if you desire further information, please write to: Office of Equal Opportunity, National Park Service, 1849 C Street, NW, Washington, DC, 20240.

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgements .....	i
Abstract .....	iii
At a Glance: Islamorada's Architectural and Archaeological Resources 2008 .....	iv
1.0 Introduction, Project Location, and Project Purpose .....	1
1.1 Introduction .....	1
1.2 Project Location .....	1
1.3 Project Purpose .....	1
2.0 Historic Overview .....	7
2.1 Introduction .....	7
2.2 Environmental and Prehistoric Cultural Background .....	7
2.3 Early History of the Keys .....	8
2.4 Post-bellum Settlement and Growth in Islamorada .....	13
2.5 Early-Twentieth-Century Developments .....	18
2.6 World War II and Recovery .....	19
2.7 Islamorada's Historic Built Environment .....	21
3.0 Methodology .....	34
3.1 Meetings .....	34
3.2 Background Research .....	34
3.3 Field Survey and Data Entry .....	34
3.4 Evaluation .....	35
4.0 Previous Surveys in Islamorada .....	35
4.1 Previous Architectural Resources Surveys in Islamorada .....	35
4.2 NHRP-Listed Resources in Islamorada .....	35
4.3 Previous Archaeological Resource Surveys in Islamorada .....	36
5.0 Survey Findings .....	37
5.1 Styles of Historic Architecture in Islamorada .....	37
Frame Vernacular .....	37
Masonry Vernacular .....	37
Ranch .....	38
A-Frame .....	39
Miami Modern (MiMo) .....	39
Mission Style .....	40
Linear Resource: 8MO03433 .....	40
5.2 Historic Architectural Styles in Islamorada .....	43
5.3 Architectural Resources in the Survey Area .....	47
5.4 Archaeological Resources in the Survey Area .....	69
5.5 Review of Archaeological Sites .....	70
8MO00012 (Lower Matecumbe Key 1) .....	70
8MO00016 (Tea Table Key) .....	71

List of Figures

Figure 1	Project Location.....	3
Figure 2	Survey Area.....	5
Figure 3	Selection from Jacques Le Moyne de Morgues, <i>Floridae Americæ Provinciae Recentis &amp; Exactissima</i> 1591.....	9
Figure 4	Selection from Bernard Romans, <i>East and West Florida</i> 1774.....	11
Figure 5	Selection from Map of the State of Florida Showing the Progress of the Surveys 1859.....	15
Figure 6	Index Sheet, New Deal Resources.....	23
Figure 6	Sheet 1 New Deal Resources.....	25
Figure 6	Sheet 2, New Deal Resources.....	27
Figure 6	Sheet 3, New Deal Resources.....	29
Figure 6	Sheet 4, New Deal Resources.....	31
Figure 7	Architectural Resources by Style.....	44
Figure 8	Historical Resources Location Map.....	45
Figure 9	Recommended Bay Ridge Historic District.....	107
Figure 10	Recommended Pen Key Club Historic District.....	109
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Index Sheet.....	111
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 1.....	113
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 2.....	115
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 3.....	117
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 4.....	119
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 5.....	121
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 6.....	123
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 7.....	125
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 8.....	127
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 9.....	129
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 10.....	131
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 11.....	133
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 12.....	135
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 13.....	137
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 14.....	139
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 15.....	141
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 16.....	143
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 17.....	145
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 18.....	147
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 19.....	149
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 20.....	151
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 21.....	153
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 22.....	155
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 23.....	157
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 24.....	159
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 25.....	161
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 26.....	163
Figure 11	Cultural Resources, All GPS Locations, Sheet 27.....	165

Photograph 35.	Overview of 8MO000021 8MO000020.	75
Photograph 36.	Hardware at 8MO000020 and 8MO000021.	75
Photograph 37.	Overview of 8MO000022.	76
Photograph 38.	Midden soil at 8MO000024.	77
Photograph 39.	Overview of 8MO000024.	77
Photograph 40.	Open space at 8MO000076.	78
Photograph 41.	Picnic pavilion at 8MO00076.	78
Photograph 42.	Site access blocked by construction fence.	79
Photograph 43.	Overview of 8MO00253 with pin flags visible.	79
Photograph 44.	Overview of 8MO01475.	80
Photograph 45.	Chimney foundation at 8MO01475.	80
Photograph 46.	Solution hole at 8MO01475.	81
Photograph 47.	View of modern development at 8MO01479.	81
Photograph 48.	Rise at rear of lot is location of midden deposits.	82
Photograph 49.	Midden deposits visible in garden area.	82
Photograph 50.	Construction at 8MO01883.	83
Photograph 51.	Construction at 8MO01883 near hammock.	83
Photograph 52.	8MO01885.	84
Photograph 53.	General Location of 8MO01885 circa 1940.	84
Photograph 54.	8MO01886.	84
Photograph 55.	Railroad Timber at 8MO01901.	85
Photograph 56.	Fallen Frame Structure at 8MO01901.	85
Photograph 57.	Solution Hole at 8MO01901.	86
Photograph 58.	Solution Hole at 8MO01901.	86
Photograph 59.	Quarry pit and channeling machine at 8MO01961.	87
Photograph 60.	Wall section of eastern cistern, facing southwest.	88
Photograph 61.	Interior of eastern cistern, facing west.	89
Photograph 62.	No access to 8MO02095.	90
Photograph 63.	Construction sign and mailbox at 8MO02095.	90
Photograph 64.	Limestone entrance pillars at 8MO02095.	90
Photograph 65.	Artifact scatter at 8MO02098.	91
Photograph 66.	Artifact scatter at 8MO02098.	92
Photograph 67.	View of 8MO03477.	92
Photograph 68.	View of 8MO03480.	93
Photograph 69.	Overview of Russell Family Cemetery.	93
Photograph 70.	Flat burial marker at 8MO04503.	93
Photograph 71.	Foundation and historical marker at 8MO04504.	94
Photograph 72.	Historic Image of 8MO01471.	98
Photograph 73.	Present Image of 8MO01471.	98
Photograph 74.	Driveway at 8MO01482.	99
Photograph 75.	Dwelling at 8MO01482.	99
Photograph 76.	Facade, 8MO04194.	100
Photograph 77.	Facade of 8MO04235.	100
Photograph 78.	Facade, 8MO04249.	101
Photograph 79.	Facade, 8MO04249.	102
Photograph 80.	Facade and east elevation, 8MO04389.	102
Photograph 81.	Rear elevation, 8MO04389.	102
Photograph 82.	Facade, 15 Pen Key Club (8MO04487).	104
Photograph 83.	Facade, 121 Pippin Drive (8MO04211).	104



## 1.0 Introduction, Project Location, and Project Purpose

### 1.1 Introduction

Islamorada's Village Code, combined with Islamorada's status as a Certified Local Government (CLG), mandates a periodic inventory of historic architectural resources. In 2008, Islamorada received a grant from the Florida Department of State, Division of Historical Resources (DHR), to conduct a reconnaissance-level survey of archaeological resources and architectural resources 50 years old or older. This survey was designed to augment and update the results of the previous surveys and identify new cultural resources. Islamorada, Village of Islands, awarded the contract for the survey to GAI Consultants, Inc., (GAI) of Orlando, Florida.

### 1.2 Project Location

Islamorada is located in the upper Florida Keys in Monroe County, Florida, south of Key Largo (Figure 1). Incorporated as a municipality in 1997, Islamorada consists of four keys: Plantation Key, Upper Matecumbe Key, Lower Matecumbe Key, and Windley Key. Key West, the county seat, is located at the southern tip of Monroe County, approximately 80 miles from Islamorada. Islamorada is bordered on the north and west by the Florida Bay and the south and east by the Atlantic Ocean/Straits of Florida. U.S. Route 1 (also known as the Overseas Highway and its former alignment known presently as the Old State Road) proceeds through Islamorada. Islamorada's municipal boundary encompasses the survey area, from Overseas Highway Mile Markers 72.5 to 90.8—an area measuring approximately 3,800 acres (1,537.8 hectares). (Figure 2)

### 1.3 Project Purpose

Islamorada's Planning and Development Services Department initiated this project to compile and present current information on the Village's architectural and archaeological resources. GAI's tasks included: the identification and review of previous surveys and inventories in the survey area; the inventory and assessment of National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) listed historic properties, Monroe County designated landmarks, and previously surveyed Florida Master Site File (FMSF) resources; and a field survey and assessment of all potentially eligible historical structures meeting the 50-year age criterion and previously-recorded archaeological resources. Islamorada Planning and Development Services Department staff requires this information to provide professional direction and reporting to the Historic Preservation Council (HPC) and the Village Council to support decision-making in regard to applications for Historic Designation and Certificates of Appropriateness. The collected information will assist both the HPC and Village Planning staff in the understanding, evaluation, and analysis of alterations, improvements, designation, or demolition of Islamorada's significant cultural resources that may come under their purview.

This survey and report implements certain policies and objectives set forth in the Village's Comprehensive Plan. Among its objectives relating to historical and archaeological sites, the Village's Comprehensive Plan seeks to preserve neighborhood quality and existing housing stock. To that end, Policy 3-1.7.3 provides for the completion of a comprehensive professional survey identifying architecturally and historically significant sites and structures in the Village. Similarly, Policy 3-1.7.4 calls for the identification and preservation of historically significant housing in the Village. The Village's Comprehensive Plan also includes an objective to protect historic resources, and Policy 5-1.13.1 describes how the Village shall promote the identification of the Village's historic, archaeological, and cultural resources by coordinating with the Florida DHR and local historical groups. In the effort to protect archaeological and historical resources, Policy 6-1.12.3 state that the Village will complete a comprehensive professional survey identifying and analyzing potential architectural and historical sites and structures in Islamorada possessing historical significance for inclusion in the Village's list of locally significant historical resources. The full text of these policies and the Village's Comprehensive Plan may be viewed at [http://www.islamorada.fl.us/newsite/comp\\_plan](http://www.islamorada.fl.us/newsite/comp_plan).